IEEE P1685 Working Group

Meeting Minutes  
6 January 2022 / 10:00 AM – 11:30 AM (EST)  
Teleconference (Teams Video Conference ID: 128 062 682 5)

1. Call to Order

10:03

1. Roll Call and Disclosure of Affiliation
   1. *Affiliation FAQs:* [*http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html*](http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html) *John Blyler (Accellera, DR)  
      David Courtright (AMD, DR)  
      Edwin Dankert (ARM, DR)  
      Jean-Michel Fernandez (Arterix, DR)  
      Eyal Herzberg (Cadence, DR)   
      Li Jun (Cloudwalk, DR)  
      Joe Yackzan (Infineon, DRA)  
      Scott Venier (NVIDIA, DR)  
      Erwin de Kock (NXP, DR)  
      David Cheng (Qualcomm, DR)  
      Richard Weber (Semifore, DR)   
      Thomas Burg (ST, DR)  
      Mark Noll (Synopsys, DR*
2. Approval of Agenda
   1. *David Courtright moves a motion to approve the agenda.  
      Mark Noll seconds the motion.  
      Erwin de Kock (WGC) asks if anyone objects to unanimous consent of the motion.  
      No objection, hence, the agenda is approved.*
3. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes
   1. [2021-12-09-minutes.docx](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzk3NjAyXQ/WzIsODE2MTA2NzZd/)  
      *David Courtright moves a motion to approve the minutes.  
      Mark Noll seconds the motion.  
      Erwin de Kock (WGC) asks if anyone objects to unanimous consent of the motion.  
      No objection, hence, the minutes are approved*
4. IEEE SA Patent & Copyright Policies  
   Call for Patents <https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/mob/slideset.pdf>

Copyright <https://standards.ieee.org/ipr/copyright-materials.html>

1. *Erwin de Kock (WGC) made a call for potentially essential patents; no one raised concerns for consideration*
2. *The copyright policy was presented. There were no questions or concerns*
3. Unfinished Business/Action Item Review
   1. [Tracking of attendance and eligible voters](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzEwMzA1XQ/WzIsNzQ1OTA1NjNd/)
      1. All 14 entity members have voting rights.
   2. Keep structPortTypeDefs element mandatory
   3. Proposal 1 by David Courtright on modes  
      “**A** register transaction can “see” different modes in the path towards the registers”

Presentation posponed to next meeting

* 1. Proposal 2 by Erwin de Kock on modes  
     “A register transaction can “see” only 1 mode in the path towards the registers”  
     Presentation postponed to next meeting

1. Technical Presentation(s), Contribution(s) or Discussion(s)
   1. Discuss other [WG comments](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsNzc3NzA5MDFd/w-ReviewCommentsOnAccelleraIPXACTWGContribution) on [draft](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzk3Nzk1XQ/WzIsODEwMzM4NTdd/) (PDF) submitted for MEC review

[Comment 34](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE0-1U) Need new SCR. Erwin de Kock to provide.

[Comment 39](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1Fo-) Added Boolean named phantom; This is a schema change.

[Comment 40](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1F0p) Rejected

[Comment 43](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1HCp) Rejected

[Comment 45](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1HE-) Remove SCR 6.53, John Blyler to update.

[Comment 46](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1HJZ) Rejected

[Comment 50](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p/aQAAAAAE1I-Y) Add table showing when default value applies, John Blyler to update.

[Comment 61](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODEwNDQ4MTVd/w-Comment61NoUnitAttributesInSingleShotDriver) No unit attributes in singleShotDriver.

Added unit attributes to schema

[Comment 62](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODEwNTY1MTFd/w-Comment62NamespaceInAttributeResolve) Namespace in attribute resolve

Remove namespace from resolve. This is a schema change.

[Comment 64](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODEzNzQ2Njdd/w-Comment64AFieldWithFieldDefinitionRefCannotBeAnAlias) A field with fieldDefinitionRef cannot be an alias

Reject moving the alias element. Update SCR wording by Erwin de Kock

[Comment 65](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODEzNzQ4Njld/w-Comment65NetlistingRules) Netlisting rules

Reject

[Comment 67](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE0MTk1MDZd/w-Comment67UpdateTGIToSupportDefaultValues) Update TGI to support default values

Defer discussion to next meeting

[Comment 86](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE0ODI3MDZd/w-Comment86SCR724And725NeedExamples) SCR 7.24 and 7.25 need examples

Add connection graph with examples

[Comment 89](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE0OTI1NTNd/w-Comment89TypeIdentifierIsUselessInTypeDefinitions) typeIdentifier is useless in type definitions

Reject

[Comment 92](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1MDAyNDBd/?&pgref=) Update addressing equation (13)

Equation is incorrect. Need ceil() function, John Blyer to update

[Comment 93](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1MDUyNzFd/w-Comment93NewSCRToCheckConsistencyOfAccessHandleSlicesSize) New SCR to check consistency of accessHandle slices size

Reject

[Comment 94](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1MDE3NzVd) SCR 7.13 clarification (typeIdentifier registerDefinitionGroup/alternateDefinitionGroup)

Update wording, Erwin de Kock to update wording.

[Comment 98](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1MzE5MTFd/w-Comment98ReadResponseHasAmbiguousDescriptions) readResponse has ambiguous descriptions

Related to modes. Postpone discussion

[Comment 99](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDI5NjVd/w-Comment99StructPortTypeDefIncorrectReference) StructPortTypeDef: incorrect reference

JohnBlyler to fix reference

[Comment 100](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDMwMDRd/w-Comment100TypoMissingPortDriverInElementsForViewRefC28) Typo: Missing Port Driver in elements for viewRef C.28

John Blyler to add driver.

[Comment 101](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDMzMDVd/w-Comment101UselessDescriptionForSubPort) Useless description for subPort

John Blyler to remove incorrect sentences.

[Comment 102](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDM1NTRd/w-Comment102WhyLastSubportInPortReferenceIsAWire) Why last subport in port reference is a wire ?

John Blyler to remove restriction.

[Comment 103](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDY3MjZd/w-Comment103StructuredPortReference) Structured port reference

Postpone discussion.

[Comment 104](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NTIzMDhd/w-Comment104AlternateRegisterInAccessPolicyDescrip) alternateRegister in accessPolicy description

Postpone discussion.

[Comment 105](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NjI1NThd/w-Comment105CleanupTGICallsAccessingReferences) Cleanup TGI calls accessing References --- OPEN

Postpone discussion.

1. New Business
   1. *No new business was stated*
2. Future Meetings
   1. Jan. 20, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   2. Feb. 3 & 17, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   3. Mar. 3 & 17 & 31, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   4. Apr. 14 & 28, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   5. May 12, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
3. Second Roll Call

*John Blyler (Accellera, DR)  
David Courtright (AMD, DR)  
Edwin Dankert (ARM, DR)  
Jean-Michel Fernandez (Arterix, DR)  
Vincent Thibaut(Arteris, DRA)  
Eyal Herzberg (Cadence, DR)   
Li Jun (Cloudwalk, DR)  
Joe Yackzan (Infineon, DRA)  
Scott Venier (NVIDIA, DR)  
Erwin de Kock (NXP, DR)  
David Cheng (Qualcomm, DR)  
Richard Weber (Semifore, DR)   
Thomas Burg (ST, DR)  
Mark Noll (Synopsys, DR)*

1. Adjourn
   1. *Scott Vernier moves to adjourn.  
      Erwin de Kock, WG Chair adjourned the meeting at 11:30 AM EST.*
   2. *Minutes Posted Richard Weber, WG Secretary.*