IEEE P1685 Working Group

Meeting Minutes  
3 February 2022 / 10:00 AM – 11:30 AM (EST)  
Teleconference (Teams Video Conference ID: 128 062 682 5)

1. Call to Order 10:04
   1. *Erwin de Kock, WG Chair, calls the meeting to order at 10:04 AM EST*
2. Roll Call and Disclosure of Affiliation
   1. *Affiliation FAQs:* [*http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html*](http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html) *John Blyler (Accellera, DR)  
      David Courtright (AMD, DR)  
      Rakesh Gulati (AMD, DRA)  
      Jean-Michel Fernandez (Arteris, DR)  
      Eyal Herzberg (Cadence, DR)   
      Vanessa Lalitte (IEEE-SA, Program Coordinator)  
      Michael Velten (Infineon, DR)  
      Scott Venier (NVIDIA, DR)  
      Erwin de Kock (NXP, DR)  
      Richard Weber (Semifore, DR)   
      Thomas Burg (ST, DR)*
3. Approval of Agenda
   1. *David Courtrightt moves a motion to approve the agenda.  
      Scott Vernier seconds the motion.  
      Erwin de Kock (WGC) asks if anyone objects to unanimous consent of the motion.  
      No objection, hence, the agenda is approved.*
4. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes
   1. [2022-01-20-minutes.docx](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzk3NjAyXQ/WzIsODE5MzMzNTZd/)  
      *David Courtright moves a motion to approve the minutes.  
      Thomas Burg seconds the motion.  
      Erwin de Kock (WGC) asks if anyone objects to unanimous consent of the motion.  
      No objection, hence, the minutes are approve*
5. IEEE SA Patent & Copyright Policies  
   Call for Patents <https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/mob/slideset.pdf>

Copyright <https://standards.ieee.org/ipr/copyright-materials.html>

1. *Erwin de Kock (WGC) made a call for potentially essential patents; no one raised concerns for consideration*
2. *The copyright policy was presented. There were no questions or concerns*
3. Unfinished Business/Action Item Review
   1. [Tracking of attendance and eligible voters](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzEwMzA1XQ/WzIsNzQ1OTA1NjNd/)
      1. All 14 entity members have voting rights.
   2. [Ballot for interpretation of access and modes in memory maps](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzEwMjg5XQ/WzIsODE5MTE4NTdd/)  
      9 votes for Option 1, 3 votes for Option 2, 2 abstain

Clarify changes required for option 1.

* 1. Add rule that the modes do not change during a transaction.
  2. Provide text changes for approval before the edits are made to the document.
  3. Provide schema changes for approval before the schema is updated.
  4. SCR’s need to be changed.
  5. Erwin de Kock to set up wiki pages and annotated PDF file for this discussion.

1. Technical Presentation(s), Contribution(s) or Discussion(s)
   1. Discuss other [WG comments](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsNzc3NzA5MDFd/w-ReviewCommentsOnAccelleraIPXACTWGContribution) on [draft](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/folder/WzIwLDEzNzk3Nzk1XQ/WzIsODE2ODMyMTBd/) (PDF)

[Comment 67](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE0MTk1MDZd/w-Comment67UpdateTGIToSupportDefaultValues) Update TGI to support default values

Clarify return types. Add null return value. Add calls to check if the elements and attributes have values in the file.

Further discussion required.

[Comment 98](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1MzE5MTFd/w-Comment98ReadResponseHasAmbiguousDescriptions) readResponse has ambiguous descriptions

[Comment 103](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NDY3MjZd/w-Comment103StructuredPortReference) Structured port reference

Further discussion required

[Comment 104](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NTIzMDhd/w-Comment104AlternateRegisterInAccessPolicyDescrip) alternateRegister in accessPolicy description

[Comment 105](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE1NjI1NThd/w-Comment105CleanupTGICallsAccessingReferences) Cleanup TGI calls accessing References

[Comment 106](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE2MDc5NDZd/w-Comment106Scr718) SCR 7.18 fieldUsageMatchAccess

Further discussion required

[Comment 115](https://ieee-sa.imeetcentral.com/p1685/doc/WzIsODE5MjgwODZd/w-Comment115SCRForAddressConsistencyInHierarchicalFamilyOfInitiatorsSeenByCPU) SCR for address consistency in hierarchical family of initiators seen by CPU

1. New Business
   1. *No new business was stated*
2. Future Meetings
   1. Feb. 17, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   2. Mar. 3 & 17 & 31, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   3. Apr. 14 & 28, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
   4. May 12, 10:00-11:30 AM EST
3. Second Roll Call
   1. *John Blyler (Accellera, DR)  
      David Courtright (AMD, DR)*  
      *Rakesh Gulati (AMD, DRA)  
      Vincent Thibaut (Arteris, DRA)  
      Eyal Herzberg (Cadence, DR)   
      Michael Velten (Infineon, DR)  
      Scott Venier (NVIDIA, DR)  
      Erwin de Kock (NXP, DR)  
      Richard Weber (Semifore, DR)   
      Thomas Burg (ST, DR)*
4. Adjourn
   1. *Eyal Herzberg moves to adjourn.  
      Erwin de Kock, WG Chair adjourned the meeting at 11:26 AM EST.*
   2. *Minutes Posted Richard Weber, WG Secretary.*