



IEEE SA - 1872.2 Standard for Autonomous Robotics (AuR) Ontology Working Group

Call and Agenda

Meeting Agenda for March 5, 2021, 1PM-2:30PM UTC

You have been invited to the IEEE SA WG P1872.2 meeting. Join the meeting:

<https://join.skype.com/Buruz9jby49e>

1. Call to order (Howard)
2. Introduction and rosters (Alberto)
3. Approve today's agenda (Howard)
4. Approve prior meeting's minutes (Alberto; February 5)
5. Essential Patent Claims (Alberto)
6. Status updates/previous action items (Howard)
7. IEEE Copyright Policy (Howard)
8. Technical discussion ('*Standard's draft - focus on Section 5*' by Mohammed)
9. Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation
10. New business/announcements/events/last thoughts
11. Close meeting (Howard)

Minutes for the Official Meeting on March 5, 2021

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Rosters

- Y and N state for Yes and No
- ^ means the attendee is a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **green** are eligible to become a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **red** are eligible to lose *Voting Membership*
- Last column contains today's meeting attendees

Attendee Name	Role	Affiliation	Current Voting	Meetings Attended / last two	5-Mar
OBSERVATIONS					
Howard Li	Chair	University of New Brunswick, Canada	Y	2	Y^
Paulo Gonçalves	Co-Chair	IDMEC, Portugal	Y	1	^
Veera Ragavan	Co-Chair	Monash University, Australia	Y	2	Y^
Alberto Olivares Alarcos	Secretary	IRI-CSIC, Spain	Y	2	Y^
Alaa Khamis	Member	General Motors, Canada	Y	2	^
Chris Nowak	Member	DST Group, Australia	Y	1	Y^
João M.L. Quintas	Member	Pedro Nunes Institute, Portugal	Y	2	Y^
Julia Bermejo	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	2	Y^
Ricardo Sanz	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	2	Y^
Stefano Borgo	Member	ISTC/ CNR, Italy	N	0	N
Edison Pignaton	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	Y	0	Y^
Elisa Tosello	Member	UNIPD, Italy	Y	2	Y^
Daniel Beßler	Member	University of Bremen, Germany	N	0	N
Mohammed Diab	Member	UPC, Spain	Y	0	Y^
Marcos E. Bareto	Member	UFBA, Brazil	N	0	N
Joanna I. Olszewska	Member	University of West Scotland, UK	Y	2	Y^
Amelie Gyrard	Member	Knoesis, Wright State University	Y	2	N^
Hiren Nakawala	Member	CMR Surgical Ltd, Cambridge, UK	Y	1	Y^
Abdelghani Cibani	Member	UPEC, France	Y	2	Y^

Minutes for the Official Meeting on March 5, 2021

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Maki Habib	Member	American University in Cairo	Y	2	Y^
Linda Li	Member		N	1	N
Koussaila MOULOUEL	Member	UPEC, France	N	1	Y
Dormant/Inactive					
Sandro R. Fiorini	Co-Chair	IBM, Brazil	N	0	
Eren Erdal Aksoy	Member	Halmstad University / Volvo	N	0	
Carlos Hernández	Member	TU Delft, Netherlands	N	0	
Joel L. Carbonera	Co-Chair	UFRGS, Brazil	N	0	
Edson Prestes	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	N	0	
Bao U. Nguyen	Member	University of Ottawa, Canada	N	0	
Kathryn Bennett	Guest	IEEE-SA	N	0	
Craig Schlenoff	Member	NIST	N	0	
Jaeho Lee	Member	University of Seoul	N	0	
JiSang Hoon	Member	KITECH, Republic of Korea	N	0	
Ki-Yeop Sung	Member	KAR, Republic of Korea	N	0	
Taeyoung Uhm	Member	KIRO, Republic of Korea	N	0	
Sebastian	Guest	IEEE-RAS	N	0	
Christy Bahn	Program Manager	IEEE-SA	N	1	
Signe Redfield	Guest	United States Naval Research Laboratory	N	0	
Ali Akbari	Guest	UPC, Spain	N	0	
Total Attendees					15
Voting Members			17		17
Voting Members Present					14
Quorum					Y

Stefano lost his voting membership and Abdelghani became a voting member.

[Approval today's meeting agenda](#)

Motion Proposal : Veera

Seconded by: Alberto

Accepted Agenda: Yes

Minutes for the Official Meeting on March 5, 2021

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Approval prior minutes

Minutes were distributed and also made available on our google drive. Thus, members could have read them, but Alberto summarized the minutes to ensure that everyone knew about them.

Motion Proposal:

Seconded by: Veera

Accepted Minutes: Yes

Call for Essential Patent Claims (Alberto)

The call was raised; no participant raised any concerns or any comments for consideration.

Status updates/previous action items (Howard)

- Standard's draft. We have already finished the first sections (1, 2, 3 and 4), note that section 4 has been moved to section 3. Today we will discuss the last remaining section, about the formalization and the appendix with the use cases.
- New ideas about other notions such as behaviors, structure, architecture, we can write a new PAR and create a new group.
- Terminology harmonization effort among IEEE's groups and also among other institutions and standards, Craig is leading. Next meeting on **Thursday, June 3rd from 10am-12pm Eastern U.S. time**. Some notes from the latest meeting:
 - [Craig] When I previously suggested that we use the terms "environment, action, and task," I made the incorrect assumption that these were common terms in many robotics standards. After reviewing many standards, I found that this was not the case. As such, I suggest that instead we focus on the concept of "robot." I have done some research into how various standards define a robot and how they "subclass" the concept, which I am happy to present during our meeting.
 - [Craig] I would also like to take a step back and get everyone's input on if they think this is a worthwhile effort overall. At a minimum, I believe there is a lot of value in getting all the standards groups together to provide updates and discuss overlaps and gaps. As such I think this group should continue to meet, but I want to discuss what the focus of the meetings should be.

Copyright Policy (Howard)

Done.

Minutes for the Official Meeting on March 5, 2021

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Howard went through some slides about the copyright policy of IEEE. This policy is relatively large so we are not going to include all the material here, but two key points must be kept in mind:

- Anything (verbal or written) we discuss we need to make sure it has not copyright, if it has, we cannot discuss it during the meeting without official permission from the copyright holder.
- Whenever you bring some material to the group and it is discussed along with our meetings, you are granting the copyright of it to the IEEE. Either if you are the holder or your affiliation center is the holder. In the later case, you would need permission from your company or university. Note that when something which has copyright it is discussed during our meetings (sometimes permission would be needed), automatically, the copyright license will be granted to the IEEE. Note that anything developed during our group work, will have a copyright license owned by IEEE once the standard gets published.

Technical discussion

Topic: *'Standard's draft - focus on Section 5'* by Mohammed

Mohammed presented the current status of the last section of our standard: axiomatization. The only remaining part is to write down the axiomatization using SUMO as the upper ontology. The implementation in OWL is done, but Mohammed needs to put the content in the document. Mohammed also presented a short text for the case study, that will be added to the appendix section of the standard. By the end of next week, we will probably have a final version that could be added to the final standard's draft.

After March 19, we will probably circulate a final version of the document for proofreading.

Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation

- [March 11] Axiomatization section and case study by Elisa and Mohammed
- [March 19] CORA's introduction (Paulo) and proofreading of the final document (Paulo, João and Veera)
- [March 25] Examples of the definitions by Alaa, Veera, Chibani and Mohammed

Minutes for the Official Meeting on March 5, 2021

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



New business/announcements/events/last thoughts

- Draft ready by the end of March and start the balloting process. In September we will submit the standard for approval.
- Next official meeting - We will probably move it to April 8, since April 2 is Easter Friday

Close meeting (Howard)

Adjourned 2:30 PM UTC