



## IEEE SA - 1872.2 Standard for Autonomous Robotics (AuR) Ontology Working Group

---

### Call and Agenda

Meeting Agenda for May 3, 2019, 1PM-2:30PM UTC

You have been invited to the IEEE SA WG P1872.2 meeting. Join the meeting:  
<https://join.skype.com/Buruz9jby49e>

1. Call to order (Howard)
2. Introduction and rosters (Alberto)
3. Approve today's agenda (Howard)
4. Approve prior meeting's minutes (Alberto; April 5)
6. Call for Essential Patent Claims (Howard)
7. Status updates/previous action items (Howard)
8. Technical discussion ('Conclusions to the ongoing Vocabulary' by Stefano Borgo)
9. Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation
10. New business/announcements/events/last thoughts
11. Close meeting (Howard)

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on May 3, 2019

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



### Rosters

- Y and N state for Yes and No
- ^ means the attendee is a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **green** are eligible to become a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **red** are eligible to lose *Voting Membership*
- Last column contains today's meeting attendees

Attendee Name	Role	Affiliation	Current Voting	Meetings Attended / last two	3-May
OBSERVATIONS					
Howard Li	Chair	University of New Brunswick, Canada	Y	2	Y <sup>^</sup>
Paulo Gonçalves	Co-Chair	IDMEC, Portugal	Y	2	Y <sup>^</sup>
Veera Ragavan	Co-Chair	Monash University, Australia	Y	1	Y <sup>^</sup>
Alberto Olivares Alarcos	Secretary	IRI-CSIC, Spain	Y	2	Y <sup>^</sup>
Alaa Khamis	Member	General Motors, Canada	Y	1	Y <sup>^</sup>
Chris Nowak	Member	DST Group, Australia	Y	2	N <sup>^</sup>
João M.L. Quintas	Member	Pedro Nunes Institute, Portugal	N	2	Y
Julia Bermejo	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	2	N <sup>^</sup>
Ricardo Sanz	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	2	Y <sup>^</sup>
Stefano Borgo	Member	ISTC/ CNR, Italy	Y	1	Y <sup>^</sup>
Edison Pignaton	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	Y	1	N <sup>^</sup>
Elisa Tosello	Member	UNIPD, Italy	Y	1	N <sup>^</sup>
Daniel Beßler	Member	University of Bremen, Germany	Y	2	<sup>^</sup>
Mohammed Diab	Member	UPC, Spain	Y	1	Y <sup>^</sup>
Marcos E. Bareto	Member	UFBA, Brazil	N	0	N
Bao U. Nguyen	Member	University of Ottawa, Canada	N	1	N
Joanna I. Olszewska	Member	University of West Scotland, UK	Y	2	Y <sup>^</sup>
Amelie Gyrard	Member	Knoesis, Wright State University	N	0	Y
Edson Prestes	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	N	1	N
Sandro R. Fiorini	Co-Chair	IBM, Brazil	N	0	N

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on May 3, 2019

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Joel L. Carbonera	Co-Chair	UFRGS, Brazil	N	1	N
Hiren Nakawala	Member	University of Verona, Italy	N	1	Y
Carlos Hernández	Member	TU Delft, Netherlands	N	1	Y
<b>Dormant/Inactive</b>					
Kathryn Bennett	Guest	IEEE-SA	N		
Craig Schlenoff	Member	NIST	N		
Jaeho Lee	Member	University of Seoul	N		
JiSang Hoon	Member	KITECH, Republic of Korea	N		
Ki-Yeop Sung	Member	KAR, Republic of Korea	N		
Taeyoung Uhm	Member	KIRO, Republic of Korea	N		
Sebastian	Guest	IEEE-RAS	N		
Christy Bahn	Program Manager	IEEE-SA	N		
Signe Redfield	Guest	United States Naval Research Laboratory	N		
<b>Total Attendees</b>					13
<b>Voting Members</b>			14		15
<b>Voting Members Present</b>					10
<b>Quorum</b>					Y

Introduction of two new members, Hiren Nakawala and Carlos Hernández. João was eligible to become a voting member and he agreed on it.

### Approval today's meeting agenda

Motion Proposal : Howard

Seconded by: Alberto

Accepted Agenda: Yes

### Approval prior minutes

Minutes were distributed and also made available on our google drive. Thus, members could have read them, but Alberto summarized the minutes to ensure that everyone knew about them.

Motion Proposal: Alberto

Seconded by: Paulo

Accepted Minutes: Yes



## Call for Essential Patent Claims (Howard)

Done

**Topic:** Essential Patent Claims (procedure)

**Presenter:** Alberto Olivares-Alarcos

Alberto presented some slides about the most relevant aspects related to one of the mandatory items of each of our official meetings: 'Call for Essential Patent Claims'. He explained what are Essential Patents and how the claims should be done by the group members. It was also slightly explained how the chair of the group should behave when a claim is done. The main reason why we did this was because Paulo found a possible essential patent some weeks ago. Ricardo did not agree that the found patent was essential for us, hence, all the procedure would not be necessary. However, after the meeting, Alberto contacted the administrator of the Patent Committee and he answered that the claims for essential patents is mandatory, it is not in our hands to decide if the patent is or not essential. Any time a patent is found, we have to write the LOA and other people will decide if the patent is or not essential for our Standard.

## Status updates/previous action items (Howard)

- Vocabulary discussion leaded by Stefano Borgo
- How our work relates to task representation group's: initial idea, they will define task while we will work on behaviours, capabilities seem to be related to both so that would be the common ground for both groups
- Possible Essential Patent - to write a LOA letter
- In person meeting of our group at ICRA has been prepared
- In person meeting at ICRA organized by Craig Schlenoff
- Cloud Robotics' paper was rejected

## Technical discussion

**Topic:** Vocabulary discussion

**Presenter:** Stefano Borgo

Stefano discussed that the definitions have already gone through several rounds of modifications so that it seems that everyone is happy now. There were only some comments about specific terms:

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on May 3, 2019

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



- Capability is weakly defined but we can move on and improve it in the future. Still could be necessary to define 'capacity' but Stefano is not familiar with it. If someone believes we need that term, that person should come up with a definition.
- Artefact and Device are used in CORA and are taken from SUMO. When drafting the standard, we would address this. Our definitions must follow the previous standard.
- Regarding 'behaviour', Signe seems to talk about it in terms of descriptions while I do it in terms of states of reality (which is not necessarily too different). Engineering Behaviour has been created to refer to different ways of actual implementation of behaviours (e.g. flow charts, state machines, etc.)
- Function vs Behaviour is probably the most tricky part here. Stefano proposed to continue working on them. We should prepare examples of how we could use them to see if the definitions could capture the knowledge properly.

Once these definitions are done (e.g. we have checked that they cover our counter-examples) we can think of defining more terms. Action was suggested by Paulo (since it is widely used) but Stefano said he would like to avoid it. In the future, we will see how to address it.

### Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation

None

### New business/announcements/events/last thoughts

- Found Patent from Magazino (see [here](#)) - Study potential issues
- Next official meeting for June 6
- ICRA 2019
  - IEEE1872.2 working group meeting at ICRA 2019, Montreal - 20 May from 9:00-11:00 (local time) in room 522b. For those attending by skype, the time is the usual time of our regular meetings (1:00 PM UTC). People attending: Edson Prestes, Signe Redfield, Alaa Khamis, Wang, Lu, Zhao, Howard Li. Paulo Gonçalves might attend.
  - Standards Strategy Meeting on May 19th - Organized by Craig Schlenoff

### Close meeting (Howard)

Adjourned 2:30 PM UTC