



## IEEE SA - 1872.2 Standard for Autonomous Robotics (AuR) Ontology Working Group

---

### Call and Agenda

Meeting Agenda for September 7, 2018, 1PM-2:30PM UTC

You have been invited to the IEEE SA WG P1872.2 meeting. Join the meeting:

<https://join.skype.com/Buruz9jby49e>

1. Call to order (Howard)
2. Introduction and rosters (Alberto)
3. Approve today's agenda (Howard)
4. Approve prior meeting's minutes (Alberto; Aug 2)
5. Status updates/previous action items (Howard)
6. Technical discussion
7. Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation
8. New business/announcements/events/last thoughts
9. Close meeting (Howard)

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on September 7, 2018

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



### Rosters

- Y and N state for Yes and No
- ^ means the attendee is a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **green** are eligible to become a *Voting Member*
- Members highlighted in **red** are eligible to lose *Voting Membership*
- Last column contains today's meeting attendees

Attendee Name	Role	Affiliation	Current Voting	Meetings Attended / last two	7-Sep
<b>OBSERVATIONS</b>					
Howard Li	Chair	University of New Brunswick, Canada	Y	2	Y^
Paulo Gonçalves	Co-Chair	IDMEC, Portugal	Y	1	Y^
Veera Ragavan	Co-Chair	Monash University, Australia	Y	2	N^
Alberto Olivares Alarcos	Secretary	IRI-CSIC, Spain	Y	2	Y^
Alaa Khamis	Member	General Motors, Canada	Y	1	Y^
Chris Nowak	Member	DST Group, Australia	Y	2	Y^
João M.L. Quintas	Member	Pedro Nunes Institute, Portugal	Y	1	N^
Julia Bermejo	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	1	Y^
Ricardo Sanz	Member	UPM, Spain	Y	1	N^
Stefano Borgo	Member	ISTC/ CNR, Italy	Y	2	N^
Edison Pignaton	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	Y	2	Y^
Elisa Tosello	Member	UNIPD, Italy	Y	2	Y^
Daniel Beßler	Member	University of Bremen, Germany	-	-	-
Mohammed Diab	Member	UPC, Spain	N	1	Y^
Marcos E. Bareto	Member	UFBA, Brazil	Y	1	N^
Bao U. Nguyen	Member	University of Ottawa, Canada	Y	1	N^
Joanna I. Olszewska	Member	University of West Scotland, UK	Y	1	N^
Amelie Gyrard	Member	Knoesis, Wright State University	Y	1	N^
Edson Prestes	Member	UFRGS, Brazil	Y	0	N
Sandro R. Fiorini	Co-Chair	IBM, Brazil	Y	0	N

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on September 7, 2018

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Joel L. Carbonera	Co-Chair	UFRGS, Brazil	Y	0	N
Hiren Nakawala	Member	University of Verona, Italy	-	-	
Carlos Hernández	Member	TU Delft, Netherlads	-	-	
Abdelghani Cibani	Member	UPEC, France	-	-	
Eren Erdal Aksoy	Member	Halmstad University / Volvo	-	-	
<b>Dormant/Inactive</b>					
Kathryn Bennett	Guest	IEEE-SA	N	-	
Craig Schlenoff	Member	NIST	N		
Jaeho Lee	Member	University of Seul	N		
JiSang Hoon	Member	KITECH, Republic of Korea	N		
Ki-Yeop Sung	Member	KAR, Republic of Korea	N		
Taeyoung Uhm	Member	KIRO, Republic of Korea	N		
Sebastian	Guest	IEEE-RAS	N		
Christy Bahn	Program Manager	IEEE-SA	N		
Signe Redfield	Guest	United States Naval Research Laboratory	N		
Ali Akbari	Guest	UPC, Spain	N		
<b>Total Attendees</b>					9
<b>Voting Members</b>			17		17
<b>Voting Members Present</b>					9
<b>Quorum</b>					Y

New voting member joined our group meetings: Mohammed Diab. Joel Carbonera lost his voting membership.

### Approval today's meeting agenda

Motion Proposal : Howard

Seconded by: Alberto

Accepted Agenda: Yes

### Approval prior minutes

Minutes were distributed and also made available on our google drive. Thus, members could have read them, but Alberto summarized the minutes to ensure that everyone knew about them.

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on September 7, 2018

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



Motion Proposal: Alberto

Seconded by: Howard

Accepted Minutes: Yes

### Status updates/previous action items (Howard)

- IROS 2018 (Workshop). Presentations should be sent to Julia
- Cloud Robotics case study
- MEPHISTO (Chris Nowak's work)

### Technical discussion

**Topic:** Case study proposal for Cloud Robotics paper

During the last weeks, Chris Nowak has been talking about his research and his ontology: MEPHISTO. This week, he sent some documents to share his view so that the rest of the group can give him some feedback. He is not an expert in robotics but he would like to start working in this direction.

In the extra material, we can see how MEPHISTO is structured (overview, three levels: Physical, Design/Functional, Intention (plans and beliefs of the robot)). We can also see what his interests are.

General comments about these documents:

1 - Chris's work is, at some points, even incoherent with our previous standard (since the ontological nature and principles of MEPHISTO is different from SUMO), some examples:

- MEPHISTO assumes that any entity is a process (even objects are processes). The main entity is the process of the world.

- MEPHISTO assumes that everything is physical, even abstract thoughts contain instances of physical things.

2 - Chris's intention is not to change our standard, just to give another view and provide his experience in developing ontologies. It is not that our group is going to change drastically the structure of CORA.

3 - Chris is specially interested in Ethical issues because he believes that having an ontology about that would help to understand what Autonomy is and how it can be modelled.

## Minutes for the Official Meeting on September 7, 2018

Alberto Olivares-Alarcos transcribing



4 - Discussion about function (design intent) vs behaviour. Veera's view about these concepts. We have Function (design purpose), Behaviour (expected and unexpected). Be careful with mixing them, Function is not equivalent to an Expected Behaviour.

5 - Discussion about Function vs Capability and how a damage in the robot can modify its capabilities.

### Next meeting's topic: nomination of presentation

- (still to decide) - Veera about 'pizza delivery case study'
- September Bao

### New business/announcements/events/last thoughts

- Next week we will work on trying to align Elisa's work to our Cloud Robotics paper
- IROS 2018 (October).
  - IROS 2018. Task Working Group Meeting, October 1st, 9AM-12PM (UTC +2), SALA MIRADOR ROOM
  - IROS 2018. AuR Working Group Meeting, October 2nd, 9AM-13-PM (UTC +2), SALA MIRADOR ROOM
  - IROS 2018. Workshop, Friday 5th
  - Special Session
- Next official meeting for October 2

### Close meeting (Howard)

Adjourned 2:30 PM UTC