IEEE 1914 NGFI

IEEE 1914.3-rev RoE – D1.6 WG Ballot Summary

Richard Tse, Microchip Technology

Dec 10, 2021

Teleconference

D1.6 WG Ballot Summary

- WG Ballot finished Aug 6, 2021

- Voting Summary:
  - Approve: 8
  - Disapprove: 2
  - Abstain: 1
  - No vote: 3

- Comments Summary:
  - Total: 317
  - Technical: 133
  - Editorial: 184

- Discussion Priority Summary:
  - Level 1:   101
  - Level 2:   53
  - Level 3:   52
  - No discussion needed: 111

IEEE STANDARDS ASSOCIATION

◆IEEE

D1.6 WG Ballot Summary

- Major editorial comment types
  - \> 50% come from the transformation of P1914.3 from Amendment to Revision status
    - Misdirected cross-references
    - Broken cross-reference links
    - Misformatted text (e.g., parameter and field names emboldenment, coloured text, font size, indentation)
    - Misformatted lists
    - Missing updates (Figure 29)
  - Grammar improvements
  - Typos
  - Punctuation issues
  - Extraneous words
  - Errant use of "should", "must", "always"
  - Inconsistent use of RoE terms (packets, common header, etc)

◆IEEE

D1.6 WG Ballot Summary

- Major technical comment types
  - References
    - Normative vs Bibliography
    - Dates
    - 5G NR cross-references
  - UDP assignment (security issues)
  - Sequence numbers - clarifications and field size errors
  - Change "must" to another term, normative or non-normative
  - Missing specifications for RoE packet formats
    - The order of I/Q samples and resource blocks (e.g., chronological ordering for time domain I/Q, subcarrier frequency ordering for frequency domain I/Q)
    - The order of rbMap bits
  - PM counter sizes

D1.6 WG Ballot Summary

- ## Technical comments, continued
  - Autonegotiation
    - Enhance events that cause state-transitions
    - Fix missing items in description of state-machine
  - YANG model
    - Read/write vs read-only for proxyLeader and proxyFollower parameters
    - Update for comments made on other subclauses of P1914.3-rev
    - Missing parameters
    - Repeated items
  - PICS
    - Re-formatting to clarify intended status
    - Corrections to some status equations
  - RoE hierarchy
    - Clarifications wrt RoE node, RoE interface, CPRI port and its mappers/de-mappers

Proposed Comment Resolution

- Spreadsheet with all comments and initial resolution proposals
    - https://sagroups.ieee.org/1914/ieee-p1914-3-rev-draft-specifications/
        - P1914.3 password needed to access the above site
    - Look for file:
        - tf3_2108_D1_6_comment_resolution_1.xls

Steps to get to Sponsor Ballot

1. Address comments for draft D1.6 in draft D1.7

2. Run WG recirculation ballot(s) on draft D1.7 and any subsequent drafts

3. Sponsor ballot process will start after all WG recirculation ballot comments are addressed

◈IEEE