

**IEEE P7000 Working Group Meeting**  
**Draft Minutes**  
**22 January 2021 / 9:00 A.M. – 11:07 A.M. (EDT)**  
**Teleconference**

*Meeting Minutes Recorded by Zviko M., P7000 WG Secretary*

**1. Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 AM. A quorum was established.

**2. Roll call and Disclosure of Affiliation**

A list of attendees present is attached.

**3. Approval of Agenda**

***Motion to approve the agenda.*** (Mover, Emile M.; Second, Rod M). The agenda was unanimously approved as presented without objection.

**4. Call for Patents ([Patent Policy](#))**

The call for patents was raised; no one raised any concerns or comments for consideration.

**5. [IEEE Copyright Policy](#)**

The WG Chair reviewed the IEEE copyright policy; no one raised any concerns or comments for consideration.

**6. Approval of December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2020 Meeting Minutes**

***Motion to approve the December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2020 meeting minutes.*** (Mover, Randy R.; Second, Gisele W). The December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2020 meeting minutes were unanimously approved subject to the following corrections:

- Corrections to Andrej F.'s first name (from Andrey to Andrej)
- In paragraph 8f the phrase "...shareholders as separate from ..." to read "...shareholders included within..."
- Ozlem Ulgen 's name to be included in the list of attendees

**7. CRG Activities Report, Ali H.**

Ali reported that the editorial work (to incorporate changes required to implement comments resolutions to D3 and produce the new draft D4) under the leadership of Team B and with the assistance of IEEE's Patrick Gibbons had been completed. Ali thanked the team and Patrick for their dedication and quality delivery. Ali further advised the WG some issues arose during the editing and would be looked at as part of today's proceedings.

**8. Editorial Team Update, Rob S.**

- a. Rob gave a presentation of the team's work and reported that:
  - Disposition of the comments to produce D4 had been completed with some revisions to the disposition sheet.
  - An updated / revised disposition sheet had been uploaded onto iMeet CentralRob thanked the CRG for quality disposition of comments which made Team B's work much easier.

Rob's presentation is available on iMeet Central.

- b. Comments Dispositions Issue 1: The need to cater for all known 4 Ethical Theories, *Sarah S.* Sarah gave a detailed presentation.
- With reference to her presentation, and noting that the move from D3 to D4 meant that companies would now need to comply only with outcomes, Sarah motioned for a change in the affected section of clause 8 that would “..mirror activities in the section ..” as Option A, against Option B “....not mirror activities...”
  - Sara made the motion, Randy R., seconded the motion.
  - After some discussions there were some objections. Carol L reminded the WG that the standard needed to be applicable internationally with different governance codes within which engineering must operate, needed to seem acceptable to the SA voting members and that the first edition of the standard be achievable for different levels maturity so that future editions can have a basis for drawing improvements from engaged engineers and organizations.
  - A poll was conducted and the results were: Option A – 12 Votes, Option B – 8 Votes. There were 2 Abstains.
  - The motion failed.
- c. Comments Dispositions Issue 2: Ethical Definitions Corrections.
- Sarah moved to make corrections to the definitions of values, ethics and ethical value
  - Randy R. seconded the motion.
  - Annette R. and Vicky H. objected to the motion as being out of order; the IEEE Program Manager, Christy echoed the same sentiments.
  - The Chair resolved to go by the advice from IEEE but proposed to get the matter discussed further and may be get it re-tabled at the next WG meeting.
  - No vote was taken, the motion was abandoned.
- d. Comments Dispositions Issue 3: Comments with inconsistent phrasing and Comments not implemented onto D4, *Annette R.*
- Through her presentation (copy available on iMeet Central), Annette explained some technical problems identified from differences in phrasing of some comments which referred to the same issue. These were grouped as {i-738, i-737, i-717}, {i-675, i-105} and {i-661, i479}.
- For the comments relating to the set/group {i-738, i-737, i-717} ,
- Annette motioned for approval of her suggested phrasing “Ethical Risk based design process aims to create an optimal system” in place of “Ethical risk-based designs aim to create an optimal system” which had been used by team B.
  - Randy R. seconded the motion.
  - The WG voted with a 19 Yes-Change to 1 No Don't change
  - The motion was approved.
- For the other sets mentioned above, and any other comments reportedly left out for incorporation into D4, the WG approved (with no need for a vote) to have these incorporated into the draft D4.

**9. WG Discussion and Vote on draft D4, *Ali H.***

- a. Approval to send D4 to recirculation.

- Annette R. moved to vote to send D4 to ballot subject to implementation of changes approved during the day's proceedings. Randy R. seconded.
- Sarah did not agree and requested that at least another meeting be held either at CRG or WG level to review definitions. Vicky H. objected and indicated that procedurally definitions issues would have to be resolved through comments from D4 circulation.
- The WG Voted and the results were: 12 Approvals to go to ballot, 8 Disapprovals, and 1 Abstain.
- The motion failed.

The chair advised the WG he would seek the SA's direction on how best the issue on definitions and any other could be resolved.

**10. Speaker's Corner, Sri, R.**

Due to lack of time, and Sri's inability to attend the day's meeting, Sri's presentation was postponed to a future WG meeting.

**11. New Business.**

None.

**12. Future Meetings**

- 19 February
- 19 March
- 16 April
- 21 May
- 18 June
- 16 July
- 20 August
- 24 September
- 22 October
- 19 November
- 17 Dec.

- Times for the WG meetings would be discussed at the 19 February 2021 WG meeting.

**13. Adjourn**

Randy R., moved to adjourn, Rod M. seconded.

The meeting was unanimously adjourned without objection at 11:07 AM (EST).

**Attendees:**

First Name	Last Name	Affiliation	Role	Officer
Christy	Bahn	IEEE Standards Association	<b>S</b>	
Lee	Barford	University of Nevada	<b>V</b>	
Bernd	Blobel	University of Regensburg, Germany	<b>NVM</b>	

Barbara	Bohr	HSR Hochschule für Technik Rapperswil/Switzerland	<b>V</b>	
Pi	Boson			
Jennifer	Costley	Self	<b>V</b>	
Brandt	Dainow	SIENNA Project for Ethical AI, EU	<b>NVM</b>	
Feyzan	Dalay	Sikorsky	<b>V</b>	
Andrej	Fajardo	Self	<b>V</b>	
Tony	Gillespie	Robotics and Automation	<b>V</b>	
Lewis	Gray	Abelia Corporation	<b>V</b>	
Beiyuan	Guo	Beijing Jiaotong University	<b>V</b>	
Tamas	Haidegger	Obudda University	<b>NVM</b>	
Victoria	Hailey	The Victoria Hailey Group Corporation (VHG)	<b>V</b>	
Ali	Hessami	Vega Systems-UK	<b>V</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Ali	Hossaini	Dept of Engineering, King's College London	<b>V</b>	
Valery	Karpov	NRC Kurchatov Institute, Russia	<b>NVM</b>	
Edmund	Kienast	Australian Digital Health	<b>V</b>	
Vlada	Leushina	National Research Center, Kurchatov Institute	<b>NVM</b>	
Gerri	Light	Western Governors University	<b>V</b>	
Carol	Long	Independent	<b>NVM</b>	
Emile	Mardacany	Self	<b>V</b>	
Zvikomborero	Murahwi	Independent	<b>V</b>	<b>Secretary</b>
Rod	Muttram	Independent Consultant	<b>V</b>	
Alexander	Novotny	Independent	<b>V</b>	
Fred	Pirajan	District University FJC, Colombia	<b>V</b>	
Randy	Rannow	Silverdraft Supercomputing	<b>V</b>	
Annette	Reilly	Unaffiliated	<b>V</b>	
Robert	Schaaf	AgilityXL	<b>V</b>	
Giuseppe	Spampinato	STMicroelectronics Italy	<b>V</b>	
Sarah	Spiekermann	University of Vienna	<b>V</b>	<b>Vice-Chair</b>
Ozlem	Ulgen	Birmingham City University, UK	<b>V</b>	

Mark	Underwood	Krypton Brothers	<b>V</b>	
Gisele	Waters	Symbiotica LLC	<b>V</b>	
Till	Winkler	Vienna University of Economics and Business	<b>V</b>	

<b>Role Legend</b>	<b>V = Voting Member</b>
	<b>NVM = Non-voting Member</b>
	<b>S = Staff</b>