

**IEEE P7000 Working Group Meeting  
Draft Minutes  
14 December 2018 / 9:00 A.M. – 11:00 A.M. (EST)  
Teleconference**

**1. Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 AM (EST). A quorum was established.

**2. Roll call and Disclosure of Affiliation.**

The list of attendees is attached.

**3. Approval of Agenda.**

***Motion to approve the meeting agenda.***

- Lewis Gray moved the motion to approve the agenda and was seconded by Gisele Waters. With this the agenda was approved.

**4. Call for Patents ([Patent Policy](#))**

The call for patents was raised; no one raised any concerns or any comments for consideration.

**5. Approval of October 5<sup>th</sup> 2018 Meeting Minutes**

***Motion to approve minutes of the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup> .***

(Mover: Gisele Waters, Second: Sarah Spiekermann). The October 5<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes were approved as submitted without objection.

**6. Matters arising from minutes of the meeting of August 24, 2018.**

a. Updates on certification programmes, Dr Sarah Spiekermann.

- Sarah reminded the Workgroup that this was an initiative of IEEE top executives. 13 Processes of Standardization would be considered. In 2019, the P7000 Standard would be considered as a basis for certification programmes and parts of the standard required to achieve this would be identified. Key to this was have the P7000 Standard ready for use by the end of 2019.
- The Chair also explained that ECPAIS would run under IEEE-SA and that there would be Partners which include Corporates, Government Ministries, Industry, the Scandinavian Government and City of Vienna. The P7000 Chair is vice chair and process advisor to the ECPAIS group and expected the P7000 Core Reference Model to be adopted as the global model for ethically aligned design of Autonomous and Intelligent Systems. The programme would start even before the Standards are published.
- Those interested in joining ECPAIS should contact the WG Chair.

## **7. Update from Subgroup Chairs, re: work to date**

### **a. Risk Subgroup, Gisele Waters**

- The Subgroup was not active at the moment and was looking forward to receiving the Processes Subgroup's report and in particular proposed corrections to the work the Risk Subgroup had done.

### **b. The Processes Subgroup, Vicky Hailey.**

- The subgroup was now meeting Weekly
- Regular membership currently Vicky Hailey (Chair), Lewis Gray (Vice-Chair), Rob Schaaf, Ruth Lewis, Zviko Murahwi. The PSG welcomes new joins;
- The PSG had set the Charter for its work which would focus on identification and specification of Processes required to implement P7000, validating the Processes to ensure that their specifications are complete to include outcomes and activities, the correct phrasing is used (shall/should), responsibility is assigned for all processes, there is distinction between normative and pseudo requirements and that both are catered for. The Subgroup would also ensure integration with other standards and that Stakeholder identification was complete to make the standard usable for all – including developers with no experience with Ethics;
- The Subgroup would work very closely with the Technical Editor.
- On progress to-date, the subgroup was working on tracing workflows and making corrections where necessary, had identified process specification corrections required, disconnects in text;
- Given the volume of work required to achieve its mandate, the Subgroup asked for an extension to the deadline for completion of its work to end of February 2019;  
Extension was granted to mid February. Voting would be required for a date beyond this one.

### **c. The Systems Of Systems Subgroup, Annette Reilly, Alexander Novotny.**

- There was no update from the group, however it was noted that the subgroup had made their submissions for inclusion in the new draft on time in September 2018.

### **d. Ethics Subgroup, Sarah Spiekermann, Jacob Metcalfe.**

- 3 Processes had been defined and are being developed making sure that they take into account the values that would have been identified;
- Processes' requirements would be appropriately linked to Risk processes;
- With the Processes now clearly defined, the applicable Annex was now being developed as well;
- The Subgroup would hold a few more calls over the next 2 months to finalize their work.

### **e. Ontology Subgroup, Mark Underwood.**

- No report was made.

## 8. Technical Editor's Update.

- (i) Progress with producing the next draft of P7000 (Issue 1 Draft 1 (I1D1))
- As promised, the new draft was ready and had been uploaded onto iMeet Central. Contributions from all subgroups to end of October had been incorporated. All authorized WG members have been given access to the draft;
  - The draft may not be perfect but was now reasonably structured to meet the needs and values of stakeholders including Engineers;
  - Comments and suggestions may be directed to the TE, the WG Secretariat and may also be raised through Subgroups;
  - An issues Log (copy available on iMeet Central) shall be used to keep a record of issues raised about the draft. Members may raise issues by making direct entries into the log or may do so via a suitable email message to the TE or the WG Secretariat;
  - The Processes Subgroup has requested for more time to review the draft and make their Comments and Recommendations. For this reason the Face-to-Face meeting would be re-scheduled to mid or end of March 2019;
  - The TE recommends that Subgroups continue working on their sections and submit comments and recommendations to the TE by February 15, 2019. TE plans to meet with Subgroup chairs between now and Feb 15, 2019. At least one WG meeting would be scheduled for between now and February 15 and all Subgroup contributions to Feb 15 would be incorporated into a new draft to be presented at the face-to-face meeting planned for mid or end of March 2019;
  - The TE recommends that the planning for the proposed (ECPAIS) certification programme runs parallel with the plan laid down in the preceding bullet point.
  - All efforts will be made to accommodate the Process Subgroup plans and work as far as possible.
- (ii) Responses to the TE's Update.
- Sri: Can the draft please include a paragraph to explain how we see P7000 advancing Humanity i.e. what the standard will accomplish;
  - Sarah: Responding to Sri's request would assist with a list of target achievements including Ethical Guidelines for Engineering and Design. Will also assist with the actual writing of the requested paragraph;
  - There is a general agreement that integration with other standards such as 15288 is important but Ethics is key to P7000.
- (iii) Responses to the Processes Subgroup Presentation (by Vicky).
- The request for extension of the deadline for completion of the Subgroup's work was supported by other Subgroup members.
  - The TE was pleased with the efforts and progress of the Processes Subgroup. However, he did not agree with pacing the development the P7000 standard on the basis of the PAR expiration date of Dec 2020 (as industry and society urgently needed guidelines for AI and AS implementations).

- As TE, Ali would like to work with the Process Subgroup to make the Subgroup's tasks achievable within the set timelines. Points of integration with other subgroups would be established to facilitate the work of the Processes Subgroup;

More Discussions;

- Lewis Gray: the Process Subgroup will go all out to ensure that Process Specifications are done to meet the requirements and expectations of the planned certification programmes;
- Gisele Waters: ML and other AI programmes are changing everyday and in some cases impacting people's lives in a bad way. To help this situation, it would be good to have an initial release of P7000 which would then be matured over time.
- Colleen Doresy for The Health Council organizing Ethics and Compliance Programmes: There is urgent need for guidance in the implementation Ethics in AI for Health Care Programmes. This requirement is being echoed across other Corporates where there is need for guidance and direction in implementing AI Programmes.

## **9. Balloting Process.**

Planning should start. Christy to coordinate the planning process and coordinate with all key players and WG members. Email correspondence would be sent out soon.

## **10. WG Face-to-Face Meeting.**

- The WG Chair proposed two dates (14-15 March 2019 and 28-29. The face-to-face meeting would take place in Vienna.
- Balloting would be required to choose which dates work best for everyone. Christy would coordinate.

## **11. Speaker's Corner.**

- a. The Secretary's update:
  - The new draft is out and is accessible via iMeet Central. It may not be shared with non WG members;
  - Efforts shall be made to ensure that Ethics and transparency are practiced in the WG's work;
  - Handling of issues raised about the draft shall be managed via an Issues Log which is also maintained from iMeet Central. Members may enter issues directly into the log or may ask the TE or Secretariat via email to enter issues (for them) onto the log.
- b. WG group members were reminded to send requests for time allocation on the Speaker's corner well in advance – at least a week in advance of a scheduled meeting. Allocation is first-come first- served and therefore the earlier the better.

## **12. Meeting dates for 2019.**

They are still to be worked out. Christy would consult with the WG Chair.

## **13. Adjourn**

The meeting adjourned at 11:00 AM (EST).

## Attendees

First Name	Last Name	Affiliation	Role	Officer
Joseph	Abandoh-Sam	Valleyview University	V	
Sriraj	Aiyer	University College London	P	
Joy	Al-Sofi	Unaffiliated	P	
Christy	Bahn	IEEE-SA (staff)	S	
James	Beetem	Brassword Enterprises LLC	V	
Barbara	Bohr	HSR Hochschule für Technik Rapperswil/Switzerland	V	
Noah	Brodbeck	Self	V	
Michelle	Dennedy	Cisco	P	
Colleen	Dorsey	University of St. Thomas	P	
Andrey	Fajardo	Self	P	
Tony	Gillespie	Robotics and Automation	V	
Lewis	Gray	Abelia Corporation	V	
Beiyuan	Guo		P	
Tamas	Haidegger	Obudda University	V	
Victoria	Hailey	The Victoria Hailey Group Corporation (VHG)	V	
John	Havens	The Global Initiative for Ethical Considerations in the Design of Autonomous Systems	V	
Ali	Hessami	Vega Systems-UK	V	Chair
Hamid	Jahankhani	Northumbria University	V	
Larry	James	RAS	P	
Rafael	Khazani	Individual	P	

Edmund	Kienast	Australian Digital Health Agency	V	
Ruth	Lewis	Swinburne University of Technology	V	
Gerri	Light	Western Governors University	V	
Emile	Mardacany	Self	P	
Jake	Metcalf	Data & Society	V	
Zvikomborero	Murahwi	Independent	V	<b>Secretary</b>
Matthew	Newman	Self	V	
Alexander	Novotny	Independent	V	
Veera	Ragavan	Self		
Sridhar	Raghavan	Independent	V	
Annette	Reilly	Unaffiliated	V	
Chris	Santos-Lang	Independent	V	
Robert	Schaaf	AgilityXL	V	
Giuseppe	Spampinato	STMicroelectronics Italy		
Sarah	Spiekermann	Vienna University of Economics and Business	V	<b>Vice-Chair</b>
Mark	Underwood	Krypton Brothers	V	
Altaz	Valani	Security Compass	P	
Gisele	Waters	Symbiotca LLC	V	
Till	Winkler	Vienna University of Economics and Business	V	
Pawel	Zgrzebnicki	University of Social Sciences and Humanities, Warsaw, Poland	V	

<b>Role Legend</b>	<b>V = Voting Member</b>
	<b>P = Participant</b>
	<b>S= Staff</b>